

Draft
Restoration Advisory Board Meeting Minutes
Former Kelly Air Force Base, TX
Kennedy High School
19 November 2002

Attendees:

Dr. Gene Lené, Restoration Advisory Board (RAB) Community Co-Chair
Mr. Sam Murrah RAB Community Member
Mr. Mike DeNuccio, RAB Community Member
Ms. Esmeralda Galvan, RAB Community Member
Ms. Katherine Ramos, RAB Community Member
Mr. Nazarite Perez, RAB Community Member
Mr. Scott Lampright, RAB Community Member
Mr. Rodrigo Garcia, RAB Community Member
Mr. Robert Silvas, RAB Community Member
Mr. George Rice, RAB Community Member
Ms. Irma Smith, RAB Community Member
Mr. Gene Dibrian, Community Member
Ms. Jeanette Almogue, Community Member
Ms. Mary Martinez, Community Member
Ms. Alonso Carrillo, Community Member
Mr. Jack Thomas, Community Member
Mr. Don Barker, Community Member
Mr. Buddy Pletz, Community Member
Mr. U.E. Villarreal, Community Member
Mr. Ralph Gomez, Community Member
Ms. Melanie Rodriguez, Community Member
Mr. Richard A. Reyes, Community Member
Mr. Lloyd Wietz, Community Member
Ms. Susan Hanson, Community Member
Ms. Guadalupe Alvarado, Community Member
Ms. Angel Martinez, Community Member
Mr. James Wittmer, Community Member
Ms. Deborah Martinez, Community Member
Ms. Bernadette Peña, Community Member
Ms. Betty Leite, Community Member
Ms. Sara Warden, Community Member
Mr. Charles Kelly, Community Member
Mr. Rick Rogus, CH2MHill
Mr. Mark Stoker, CH2MHill
Mr. Bob Rasmussen, Greater Kelly Development Authority (GKDA)
Ms. Abigail Power, Texas Commission on Environmental Quality (TCEQ)
Mr. Mark Weegar, TCEQ
Mr. Richard Egan, TCEQ
Mr. John Deering, TCEQ

Mr. Gary Miller, US Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)
Mr. Adam Antwine, Air Force Real Property Agency/Division Kelly (AFRPA/DCK)
Mr. Doug Karas, AFRPA/DC-Kelly
Mr. William Ryan, AFRPA/DC-Kelly
Ms. Norma Landez, AFRPA/DC-Kelly
Ms. Vanessa Musgrave, Air Force Center for Environmental Excellence (AFCEE)
Ms. Linda Kaufman, San Antonio Metropolitan Health District (SAMHD)
Mr. Abe Escarzaga, SAMHD
Ms. Blanca Hernandez, SAMHD
Ms. Nicole Rodgers, SAMHD
Ms. Kyle Cunningham, SAMHD
Mr. Nick Rodriguez, BexarMet Water
Mr. Hector Morales, Office of US Congressman Ciro Rodriguez
Ms. Laurie Callaway, Bearing Point
Ms. Sara Phippen, JOVEN Organization
Dr. David Smith, Smith & Associates
Mr. Eddie Martinez Booz Allen Hamilton (Booz Allen)
Mr. Hugh Farr, Booz Allen
Ms. Megan Mabee, Booz Allen
Ms. Susan Hook, Booz Allen
Ms. Lynn Myrick, Booz Allen
Ms. Christine Best, ASE Inc.

The meeting began at 6:13 PM.

Dr. David Smith introduced the Restoration Advisory Board (RAB) Co-Chair, Dr. Gene Lené, who asked the board members to introduce themselves. He also congratulated Mr. George Rice who recently won the election to the Edwards Underground Water District and Mr. Nazarite Perez who despite losing his bid for Railroad Commissioner, did manage to garner 100 votes.

Community Comment Time

Ms. Angel Martinez expressed doubts and frustrations with the recently released Mortality Study. She described her community as being rife with cancers and ALS cases and that the community still suffers despite the findings of the Mortality Study. Ms. Guadalupe Alvarado, who introduced herself as Ms. Martinez's mother, described the community around Kelly, as filled with sick children and mothers having low-weight babies. She also said she is fearful for the future of her community. Ms. Alonso Carrillo stated that while new to the Kelly cleanup issue she did say that many of the illnesses are real and that she as known several people have died. She said she also suffers from conditions that she attributes to the contamination caused by Kelly.

RAB Elections

Dr. Smith invited the prospective RAB candidates to approach the microphone and present themselves to the RAB for consideration to the board. Mr. Ross Omar Garcia,

while not physically present, asked Mr. Martinez to read a prepared statement outlining his qualifications. His statement addressed his membership in the Riverside Neighborhood Association and of his concern for the affected community. Mr. Ralph Gomez introduced himself as a staffer for City Council District 6 Councilman David Garcia. Mr. Rice asked if Mr. Garcia were to leave City Council, would Mr. Gomez remain on the RAB. Mr. Gomez said that he would. Ms. Bernadette Peña who represents the Palm Heights Neighborhood Association said her concerns were for the community as well as for moving forward on the cleanup. Mr. Buddy Pletz introduced himself as a member of a search committee representing the Salvation Army. He said he felt he could contribute to the discussion on the issues facing the RAB. Mr. Brian Skorbarcek introduced himself as an employee of the Standard Aero Corporation. He said that the industrial community is an area in which he has an interest. He added that he had nationwide experience in compliance and restoration issues. Mr. Rice asked if Mr. Skorbarcek's employer might be held responsible for contributing to the contamination at Kelly. Mr. Skorbarcek said the question was interesting. Mr. Silvas asked if the Standard Aero kept bottled water for its employees. Mr. Skorbarcek said yes. Mr. Rice asked that the RAB be notified if any prospective RAB candidates worked as contractors or were employed by the Air Force.

Mr. DeNuccio asked what constituted the affected area. Mr. Martinez answered saying the RAB Charter Review Subcommittee determined what constituted the affected area. According to the RAB Charter Review Subcommittee, a community member must live, own property or work in the affected area. Dr. Smith qualified the discussion by saying that the addendum to the RAB, in terms of the definition of affected area, was an issue that could only be determined by the RAB's adoption of the addendum before the election. Mr. Perez said that he recognized Ms. Peña to be an active member of the community and he would love to see her voted on. Ms. Ramos asked Mr. Pletz where his construction activity had occurred. He stated that he had worked on Salvation Army projects throughout the city.

Mortality Study Presentation-Lt. Colonel Kenneth Cox, MD Air Force Institute for Environment, Occupational and Risk Analysis (AFIERA)

Dr. Cox introduced himself and described his form of medicine as epidemiology. Mr. Lampright asked if it would be possible to do an age adjusted study. Dr. Cox said this study was adjusted for age and for comparisons of rates. Dr. Cox also said the presentation came from an article in the Journal of Occupational and Environmental Medicine. Mr. Murrah asked if the study examined exposures. Dr. Cox said the study did not address exposure as part of the study from a comparative standpoint. Ms. Smith asked where the Good Housekeeping got their data. Dr. Cox said the Good Housekeeping Study focused on much older data. He added that the AFIERA study only covered a twenty-year time span. Ms. Smith asked where the Air Force kept its records. Dr. Cox said the records came from the St. Louis archives, which did suffer from a fire that destroyed 30% of the records.

Ms. Smith asked what the composition of the San Antonio Metropolitan Health District (SAMHD) health working group was. Mr. Sam Sanchez said there were no current studies ongoing. He also added that the mortality study was very important. Mr. Sanchez stressed the importance of the breast and liver cancers that emerged from the study. He added that it was important to keep in mind that the study focused on former Kelly workers. Mr. Sanchez also said the worker cohort was young and for that reason, the result could change over time. Mr. Sanchez added that an lesson from a public health perspective is early detection and prevention.

Mr. Rasmussen asked how the healthy worker effect figured into the study. Dr. Cox said the military workers represented the extreme case of the population. He continued saying that a worker population will always appear healthier than a non-worker population. Mr. Rice stated that he was surprised by the ALS results. He said he understood that a disproportionate number of former workers had contracted ALS. Dr. Cox said the study was not 100% accurate in terms of all the ALS victims because exact cause of death was not fully known. He said that ALS was not always listed as the cause of death. Mr. Rice asked if the contractor that performed the study had ever worked for the Air Force before. Dr. Cox said it was that firm's first Air Force contract. Ms. Smith asked hypothetically if she would qualify for compensation by the federal government as a result of her illnesses that she directly attributed to Kelly contamination. Dr. Cox said he was not qualified to answer a question on federal employment compensation. Mr. Rasmussen asked for the relationship with the ALS Association. Dr. Cox said the Kelly Health Information Working Group contacted the local ALS Association chapter, which then notified the national office who collaborated on the study. Mr. Rice asked if there existed TAPP monies to examine the ALS Mortality study. Mr. Doug Karas stated that money was available but that the RAB would need to determine the scope of that effort.

RCRA Facility Investigation-Mr. Peter Lynch, Clearwater Revival

Mr. Rice asked where the 10 to the negative 5 figure came from. Mr. Patrick Lynch said it was his own figure. Mr. Rice asked about the slurry walls poor performance. Mr. Lynch said it could have been poor construction. He added that sections of the wall were not able to break through the Navarro clay. Mr. Silvas asked about the hard gravel and if it could be a container of some sort. Mr. Silvas also asked about inconsistencies in data and if those inconsistencies could corrupt the entire study. Mr. Lynch said that that was possible. Mr. Sanchez then asked if the chemicals found correlated with contamination levels determined. Mr. Lynch said the contamination was present before the slurry wall's was installed. Mr. Sanchez then asked if the timelines for the cleanup were still accurate. Mr. Lynch said that the data he reviewed was inconclusive. The cost would be for extracting groundwater and certainly impact cleanup timeframes. Mr. Mark Weegar stated that the slurry wall should be characterized as an interim action, just as PRBs. The containment of the DNAPL Dense Non Aqueous Phase Liquids was essentially a stop gap measure. Mr. Lynch also said that the contaminants included in the DNAPL are PCE & TCE. Mr. Garcia asked about the timelines needed for the total cleanup necessary. Mr. Lynch said cost estimates were not the focus of his report. He did say the process would consume a lot of time. Mr. Silvas asked who prepared the data he reviewed. Mr.

Lynch said the contractor was SEI and that he was unaware that they were still working for the Air Force. Mr. Sanchez asked if the slurry wall was an ineffective interim measure. Mr. Lynch said the data was inconclusive. Mr. Silvas asked where the lead and byproducts came from. Mr. Lynch said the sources were areas of highly chlorinated solvents. Ms. Esmeralda Galvan asked if the slurry wall leaks would take the form of vapors. Mr. Lynch said that any vapors would have nothing to do with the slurry walls effectiveness. Mr. Rice asked Mr. Adam Antwine if the AFRPA would respond to Mr. Lynch's report. Mr. Antwine said that as developments occur, that the Technical Review Subcommittee (TRS) would be the best forum for those discussions. Mr. Silvas asked Mr. Antwine if SEI was still being used as an Air Force contractor. Mr. Antwine said yes. Mr. Silvas asked if that decision would be reevaluated. Mr. Antwine said the awarding of contracts is a subject that is constantly under review.

Addendum to the RAB Charter Review Subcommittee-Dr. David Smith

Mr. DeNuccio stated that the affected community referred to appendix A of the RAB Charter. He also asked Mr. Martinez about the applications being taken in January as opposed to the fall every year. Mr. Karas said the reason for conducting the recruitment for new RAB members was so as not to conduct any elections over the holiday season. Dr. Smith added that he felt it was important to accept the addendum but also to allow flexibility in the process. Mr. Martinez made suggested changes in the addendum language. Dr. Smith recommended the addendum be taken up in the RAB Charter Review Subcommittee. Mr. DeNuccio moved for acceptance of the addendum to the RAB Charter and the RAB accepted it. Mr. DeNuccio also thanked those members of the RAB Charter Review Subcommittee for their work on the addendum issue.

RAB Application-Dr. David Smith

Mr. Silvas asked if there was a specific age limit for RAB membership. Mr. DeNuccio said that some bodies require at least 18 years of age. Dr. Lené asked that the background color is attractive but difficult to read. Mr. DeNuccio remarked that there were a few instances in the application the AFBCA's old name is written where the new name AFRPA should be. Ms. Ramos said the old TNRCC name should also be changed to reflect their new name. Dr. Smith asked the RAB for a motion to accept the recommended changes. Mr. DeNuccio motioned and Ms. Ramos seconded the motion, and the motion passed.

SAMHD-Mr. Sam Sanchez

Mr. Sanchez said SAMHD would be conducting additional produce studies, this time focusing on cactus native to the area. He also said that the SAMHD and Air Force staff hand sealed over 60 wells. He encouraged the RAB and members of the audience to please communicate information on existing wells either to SAMHD or to the Air Force. Ms. Galvan asked if there were any dates for the new study. Mr. Sanchez said he would like to have results at the next RAB.

AFRPA Update-Mr. Adam Antwine

Mr. Antwine said that the Air Force Base Conversion Agency (AFBCA) had been renamed the Air Force Real Property Agency (AFRPA). He also said 15.3 million dollars was available for cleanup in the upcoming year. Mr. Antwine added that there were some new construction activities like the groundwater treatment plant on Growdon Road in north Kelly. The other item, the demolition of the Industrial Waste Treatment Facility is about 70% complete. Mr. Antwine also stated that construction near Boeing, Lockheed-Martin and Standard Aero work areas in the form of PRBs was also on the horizon. He also addressed the issue of US Environmental protection Agency (EPA) Environmental Justice (EJ) grants. The deadline is December 18, 2002. He continued saying that the RAB can recall Ms. Tonya Huerta was successful in attaining this funding last year.

Ms. Galvan said she could not believe that with all the money spent thus far, that no links to diseases and been made. She asked that her comments be part of the formal record. Mr. Silvas asked if there was a spill report available. Ms. Abbi Powers replied that to her knowledge there existed no spill report. Ms. Smith said that while she was at Kelly she witnessed many spills. Ms. Smith asked if there were any air studies available on any of the bases in San Antonio. She asked if the SAMHD would perform coordinated air, water and health studies. Mr. Sanchez said no. He said that ozone levels in San Antonio were very high. In reference to air studies, only the ATSDR is conducting a study based on data from Kelly, although it will not be available until later next year. Mr. Sanchez said that ozone could also lead to upper respiratory issues. Mr. Garcia said that the Alamo Area Council of Governments (AACOG) had conducted an air emission study in 1996. He also encouraged the RAB to call Mr. Peter Bella at AACOG for further information. Mr. Garcia said he had requested from AACOG the number and kinds of air quality violations Kelly was responsible for over the years. Mr. Garcia also added that Air Force cleanup program funding was insufficient.

The October RAB meeting minutes were approved.

November RAB Action Items:

The RAB action items included mailing out RAM applications, as well as providing Mr. Garcia with information on ozone issues relevant to Kelly.

Ms. Galvan asked Mr. Sanchez why there could not be more studies on ex-Kelly workers. Mr. Sanchez said studies were already underway. He added that the only data being gathered currently are the Environmental Health and Wellness Center (EHWC) was intake data. Mr. Sanchez said he believed a study such as Ms. Galvan described could be done with the complete support of the Air Force.

Dr. Smith reminded all that the next RAB is scheduled for Tuesday January 21, 2002.

The meeting adjourned at 9: 42 p.m.